

Examples of Broward County Public Schools Human Resources Internal Control Issues Related to Candidate Selection

From 9/7/23 Audit Committee Meeting

Nathalie Lynch-Walsh, Ph.D., Audit Committee Chair

2019 Chief Human Resources & Equity Officer

See attached files: Chief HR 05-15; Chief HR 05-20; Chief HR Roster; HR Chief Applications and Resumes for Alexander/Strauss/Bickley/Johnson/Tomanio/Wallace

Multiple deviances from School Board Policy 4002.13 - SELECTION AND APPOINTMENT OF DISTRICT LEVEL ADMINISTRATIVE AND SUPERVISORY, PROFESSIONAL AND TECHNICAL PERSONNEL resulted in a High School Cadre Director being recommended by the Superintendent for approval by the School Board on [6/11/19](#). Each personnel recommendation brought to the Board is initialed by EMC and contains the statement “this individual has been selected as the best qualified candidate for the position based on education, professional experience, and responses to the interview questions.” The highest ranked interview candidate had 30 years of HR experience, a Bachelor’s degree in Human Resources, and an MBA in Industrial Relations.

- **Chief HR Roster:** According to SB Policy 4002.13 (2019 version), applicants are screened for minimum qualifications by someone from Non-Instructional staffing. Then applicants are screened for skills linked to the position’s roles and responsibilities. The six candidates with the highest-ranked screening scores move on to the interview phase.
 - ✗ During this selection process, only points assigned to minimum qualifications are included on the roster.
 - ✗ As candidates who did not score the highest in minimum qualifications were selected to be interviewed, it is unclear how the five candidates interviewed on 05-15-19 were selected.
 - ✗ It is unclear how a High School Cadre Director received a higher screening score than seasoned HR professionals. Ex. the Cadre Director received a minimum qualification score of 10, while the highest ranked interview candidate with 30 years of HR experience received an 8.
 - ✗ The BCPS Director of Employee and Labor Relations also received a 10, but she was not selected for an interview. There was an asterisk in the “current employment” field, but no explanation as to its meaning. Several other highly screened individuals, some of whom were interviewed, also had an asterisk in the same field—it is possible missing asterisks were a formatting error.
- **Chief HR Interviews 05-15-19:** According to SB Policy 4002.13 (2019 version), “the final interview committee will interview the candidates using behavioral interviewing techniques. The interview committee will be trained in behavioral interviewing. The highest scoring candidate(s) will be recommended to the Superintendent for consideration.”
 - ✗ The internal candidate who was ultimately approved by the School Board based on the Superintendent’s recommendation was not interviewed on 5/15/19.

This document was created by Chair Dr. Lynch-Walsh. The Office of the Chief Auditor did not contribute or have any input on this document.

- ✖ The highest-ranked candidate interviewed on 5/15/19 was not interviewed on 5/20/19, but the #2 and #3 ranked candidates were interviewed a second time. The highest-ranked candidate was never called back for a second interview.
- **Chief HR Interviews 05-20-19:** According to SB Policy 4002.13 (2019 version), “the final interview committee will interview the candidates using behavioral interviewing techniques. The interview committee will be trained in behavioral interviewing. The highest scoring candidate(s) will be recommended to the Superintendent for consideration.”
 - ✖ The Superintendent, who makes the personnel recommendation to the School Board, apparently did not interview the applicant ranked the highest from the 5/15/19 interview.
 - ✖ The internal candidate who was ultimately approved by the School Board based on the Superintendent’s recommendation was interviewed once, on 5/20/19, without any scores being assigned to him or the other two applicants.
 - ✖ One of the internal candidate’s professional references was on the 5/20/19 Interview Panel. She did not interview the highest ranked applicant from 5/15/19.

2019-21 Director, Business Support Center

See attached files Business Support Center_Smith Docs; Director, Business Support Center_CC-1 Amendment

- **CC-1: Job Description revision 12/11/19.** Board discussion made it clear intent was for the person selected to at a minimum have a solid foundation in accounting, finance, or business as an undergrad. HR Chief Alan Strauss added “or related field. Amendment specifically mentioned undergraduate degree. At the time there wasn’t a concern that staff would use a loophole of a generic master’s degree as a Preferred Qualification rationale to allow someone with an undergraduate degree in Kinesiological Sciences and a [Masters degree in Organizational Leadership and Management](#) (6 finance-related credits) to be hired for the position:

When there is a minimum degree qualification and a preferred degree qualification, a candidate can meet the degree qualification with either type of degree. A master’s degree will qualify a person as it falls under the preferred degree qualification. An applicant who does not have a master’s degree would need to have a bachelor’s degree in Finance, Accounting, Business Administration or a related field.

See below:

EXAMPLE: Masters not required to qualify under Preferred	EXAMPLE: Masters must be related to qualify under Preferred
<p>MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS & EXPERIENCE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An earned bachelor’s degree from an accredited institution in Finance, Accounting, Business Administration or related field. • A minimum of ten (10) years, within the last fifteen (15) years, of progressively more responsible experience in the field related to the performance responsibilities of the position. • Prior work experience in fiscal, operational, and managerial oversight for diverse operations in a large institutional setting. • Working knowledge gained from experience in the following fields: Auditing, Internal Accounts, Accounting, Budget or Payroll. • Excellent verbal and written communication skills. • Computer skills as required for the position. <p>PREFERRED QUALIFICATIONS & EXPERIENCE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An earned master’s degree from an accredited institution. • Bilingual skills. 	<p>MINIMUM QUALIFICATIONS & EXPERIENCE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An earned bachelor’s degree from an accredited institution in architecture, engineering, building construction or field related to the title of the position. • A minimum of ten (10) years, within the last twelve (12) years, of progressively more responsible experience in the field related to the title of the position, including at least two (2) years in a leadership position within the engineering, facilities or construction discipline. • Valid FL Registration as an Architect, Licensed Contractor, or Licensed Professional Engineer. • Computer skills as required for the position. <p>PREFERRED QUALIFICATIONS & EXPERIENCE:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • An earned master’s degree from an accredited institution in architecture, engineering, or field related to the title of the position. • Bilingual skills.

2022-23 Chief Facilities Officer

See attached file - Public Records Request - 2324-00123 - Facilities Chief for screening, interview scores, resumes

According to School Board Policy 7150, the School Board, “THROUGH ITS HUMAN RESOURCES POLICIES, THE SCHOOL BOARD OF BROWARD COUNTY, FLORIDA, (HEREINAFTER REFERRED TO AS THE BOARD) WISHES TO ESTABLISH CONDITIONS THAT WILL RECRUIT AND SELECT THE BEST QUALIFIED PERSONNEL FOR ALL POSITIONS.”

- It appears applicants are eligible to earn six points for minimum qualifications, but it is unclear if each minimum qualification is worth the same number of points as applicants either receive a checkmark or a blank.
- It also appears applicants are eligible to earn five points for preferred qualifications, but it is unclear how those five points are distributed.
- Applicants can earn up to 50 points on performance responsibilities. Applicants are scored on a scale of 1 to 5, with each of the 10 criteria appearing to weigh equally.
- Under this system an applicant from Indiana who obtained a Florida Architect’s license in 2022, with no discernable Florida experience, was deemed to have “familiarity with Florida Building Code and State Requirements for Educational Facilities (SREF).” This same person received the highest interview score. It is unclear why this person wasn’t recommended to the School Board for appointment as the best qualified candidate.